LOSS AND GAIN IN TRANSLATION PROCESS OF A COMIC “THE ADVENTURES OF TINTIN: TINTIN IN AMERICA” INTO INDONESIAN VERSION “PETUALANGAN TINTIN: TINTIN DI AMERIKA”

JOURNAL ARTICLE

Submitted in partial fulfillment of the requirements for the Degree of Sarjana Sastra (S.S.) in English Language

By:

Sulistyoko Agustina

C11.2008.00932

ENGLISH DEPARTMENT, FACULTY OF HUMANITIES
DIAN NUSWANTORO UNIVERSITY SEMARANG
2013
LOSS AND GAIN IN TRANSLATION PROCESS OF A COMIC “THE ADVENTURES OF TINTIN: TINTIN IN AMERICA” INTO INDONESIAN VERSION “PETUALANGAN TINTIN: TINTIN DI AMERIKA”

Sulistyoko Agustina
English Department, Dian Nuswantoro University

ABSTRACT

The thesis is entitled Loss and Gain in Translation Process of a Comic “The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America” into Indonesian Version “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika”. The aim of the thesis is to analyze deeply about the kinds of structural loss and gain found in the comic. The discussion began by collecting the data both the English version and Indonesian version to be read and to find some loss and gain in the translation process of the comic. The next step was describing the kinds of loss and gain in the process of translation. Qualitative research was used as the method of the research. The documentation method was used to complete this study. There are 130 patterns of loss and gain in the translation process of the comic “The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America” into Indonesian version “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika”. The number of loss is 111 patterns and the number of gain is 19 patterns. As the result of the research, the researcher concluded that the translator sometimes lost or gained some words, phrases or even clauses to make the translation works acceptable and readable to the target readers and to make it sounds more natural in the target language.

Keywords: loss, gain, translation, comic


Kata kunci: penghilangan, penambahan, penerjemahan, komik
INTRODUCTION

People use language to communicate each other. By using language, people can give or get any information about anything from many ways. Language itself is a system of communication that enables human to cooperate. Language is considered to be a system of communication with other people using sound, symbols, and words in expressing a meaning, idea, or what is thought.

According to The New International Webster’s Comprehensive Dictionary of The English Language (2003:716), language means the expression and communication of emotions/ideas between human beings by means of speech and hearing, the sounds spoken or heard being systematized and confirmed by usage among a given people over a period of time or the words forming the means of communication among members of a single nation or group at a given period.

Furthermore, according to Hornby (2000:721), language means “The system of communication in speech and writing that is used by people of a particular country”. It is clear that language is used for communication among people in a particular country over a period of time.

Nowadays, English becomes an important language for the whole world. In many countries in the world, people start to use English as a daily language although they have their own language already. So, people always learn how to make a good translation from English into their own language and from their own language into English. There are various reasons why people want to learn English. Some people need it so much to enlarge their business or another projects or jobs, some other people just want to know about English so they can understand the meaning anytime they watch an English movie or listen to an English song. However, some other people do it because they want to be an expert of English. Because of this reason also, there are so many people who wants to know how to make a good translation from English into their own languages and vice versa. About translation, Brislin (1976: 1) explained that, “Translation is a general term referring to the transfer of thoughts and ideas from one language to another, whether the language is in written or oral form, whether one or both languages are based on signs, as with signs of the deaf”. However, Larson (1984:3) states that translation is studying the lexicon, grammatical structure, communication situation, and cultural context of the source language text, analyzing it in order to determine its meaning, and then reconstructing this same meaning using lexicon and grammatical structure which are appropriate in the receptor language and its cultural context.

Another expert, Wilss (1982: 3), states that translation is a transfer process which aims at the transformation of a written source language text (SLT) into an optimally equivalent target language text (TLT), and which requires the syntactic, the semantic, and the pragmatic understanding and analytical processing of the source text. Syntactic understanding is related to style and meaning. Understanding of semantics is meaning related activity. Finally, pragmatic understanding is related to the message or implication of a sentence. This definition does not states what is transferred. Rather, it states the requirement of the process.
Translation typically has been used to transfer written or spoken SL texts to equivalent written or spoken TL texts. In general, the purpose of translation is to reproduce various kinds of texts—including religious, literary, scientific, and philosophical texts—in another language and thus making them available to wider readers. The difference between a SL and a TL and the variation in their cultures make the process of translating a real challenge.

There are many kinds of texts or scripts that can be translated into TL, for example: short text, movie script, song lyric, comic, novel, etc. And the researcher uses comic as a subject to be analyzed because there are some difficulties in translating comic which sometimes it could not be found in other texts.

Comic is a magazine that contains story in pictures (Collins Cobuild Dictionary, 2006). There are some difficulties in translating comic which are not found in other texts. For example: the translator of comic should be able to choose the simple words to fit the capacity in the bubbles. Besides that, the comic translators have to build their imagination by using the right words to bring the readers to get inside the story. And to make a good translation of comic, one of the strategies that usually used by the translators is loss and gain. And this is what the researcher analyze about.

There are so many comics that have been translated into some other languages. One of the most popular comic in the world is The Adventures of Tintin that were written by Herge. This comic is originally written in France then it was translated into some languages including English by Leslie Lonsdale-Cooper and Michael Turner and into Bahasa Indonesia by Donna Widjajanto.

The Adventures of Tintin (French: Les Aventures de Tintin) is a series of comic albums created by Belgian artist Georges Remi (1907–1983), who wrote under the pen name of Hergé. The series is one of the most popular European comics of the 20th century, with translations published in more than 50 languages and more than 200 million copies of the books sold to date (http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/The_Adventures_of_Tintin).

And for this research, the researcher uses one of the popular series of Tintin entitled “The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America”. This honorific title was written in 1931 and was published for the first time at 1932 and had been republished at 2002. The researcher decided to use this comic because there is something interesting in the comic. Tintin was firstly written in Belgian language and it was translated into some languages includes English, so the data used by the researcher is the translation of the translated comic. The researcher compares between the English version and Indonesian version of this comic.

The case being analyzed in this research is loss and gain, one of the key issues in translation studies. According to Bassnett, loosing or gaining meaning in the TLT results from language differences (1991: 30). Language differences usually result in untranslatability (Bassnett, 1991: 32), which inevitably leaves the translator no choice but to pick a TL expression that has the closest meaning. It happens due to various causes. Lack of tenses in the TL, for example, would lead to loss of temporal meaning, while different mind set between SL and TL readers may, at the same time reduce and gain meaning.
METHOD

Research Design
The aim of this research is to analyze the loss and gain in translation process of the comic. The method used in this research is qualitative research method. And the source data used is the comic of Tintin “The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America” and the Indonesian version entitled “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika.”

Unit of Analysis
The researcher focuses on the utterances written in the source language comic and the target language comic which show the loss and gain in its translation process.

Source Data
The data were taken from the comic of Tintin entitled “The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America” and the Indonesian version entitled “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika”. There are 639 utterances in each version of the comic, English and Indonesian version.

Technique of Data Collection
The data of this study were collected by using following steps:

a. Collecting the data from a comic Tintin entitled “The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America” and the Indonesian version entitled “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika”
b. Scanning the comics for presentation needs
c. Analyzing the data consisting of loss and gain in translation
d. Describing kinds of losses and gains found the utterances both in English and Indonesian version

Technique of Data Analysis
After the data were completely collected, it is analyzed by using the following steps:

a. Writing the data that has been classified into tables
b. Comparing the data of the English and Indonesian version
c. Identifying the utterances consisting of loss and gain in translation
d. Interpreting the data

FINDING AND DISCUSSION
This chapter presents the data analysis in order to present the result of the research. The data analysis covers the finding of loss and gain in the comic “The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America” that has been translated into Indonesian version “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika” and its discussion.

One utterance is in one bubble, and as the result, the researcher found 130 bubbles of loss and gain in the comic. They can be stated as follows:
The number of loss process is 111 bubbles and the number of gain process is 19 bubbles, so the total number of loss and gain process found in the comic “The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America” which has been translated into “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika” is 130 bubbles.

For the brief explanation about loss and gain process in the comic “The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America” into Indonesian version “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika”, the researcher explains it into the following tables below:

### Table 1. Loss Process in The Comic “The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America” into “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Patterns of Loss</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Word Loss</td>
<td>34</td>
<td>30%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Phrase Loss</td>
<td>62</td>
<td>56%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Clause Loss</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>14%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>111</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

From the table above, it can be seen that the number of loss process found in the utterance of the comic The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America and its translation Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika is 111 bubbles, consists of 33 word losses or it can be said 30% of all patterns, 62 phrase losses or 56%, and 15 clause losses or 14% of all patterns. The highest percentage of all is phrase class loss.

### Table 2. Gain Process in The Comic “The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America” into “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika”

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>Patterns of Gain</th>
<th>Quantity</th>
<th>Percentages</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Word Gain</td>
<td>15</td>
<td>79%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Phrase Gain</td>
<td>4</td>
<td>21%</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Total</td>
<td></td>
<td>19</td>
<td>100%</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the gain process of the comic The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America and its translation Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika the researcher found 19 bubbles, consists of 15 patterns of word gain or 79% of all patterns and 4 phrase gains or 21% of all patterns. The researcher did not found any pattern of clause gain in the comic.

1. The Discussion of Word Loss

The researcher found 33 bubbles of word loss in the comic The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America and its Indonesian version Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika. To know more about the details, the researcher explains the analysis below:
In the first excerpt, there is an utterance in the source language *hands up, buddy!* and *angkat tangan* in the target language. It can be seen that the translator did not translate the word *buddy* from source language into target language. The translator did the process that way because the italicized word mentioned before is just an addressing word, so it does not make any difference if the translator lost that word. Besides that, the contexts in both versions of comic are still the same. The important one is that the readers can get the information that the policeman is arresting the man on the car and asks him to put his hands up.

In the picture above, it can be seen that Tintin is carried by the ambulance guard and there are some people who see him. One of them says an utterance that is written in the source language *Gee! The poor kid...* However, in the target language, the same utterance has been translated into *Pemuda malang...* The words *Gee! and The* in the first utterance and the word *He* in the second utterance of the source language had been abolished by the translator and this process is called ethnographic translation. The translator did the process this way to explicate the cultural context of the source language and the target
language. Besides, the italicized word mentioned before is a kind of expression of compassion towards other and the meaning of the utterance already sent to the readers by the utterance of pemuda malang.

2. The Discussion of Phrase Loss

The researcher found 62 bubbles of phrase loss in the comic The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America and its Indonesian version Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika. To know more about the details, the researcher explains the analysis below:

**Excerpt 3, Page 3**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Language</th>
<th>Target Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>You kidnapped me! Come on... Why?</strong></td>
<td><strong>Kau menculikku! Kenapa?</strong></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In the picture of source language text, it is written an utterance by Tintin **You kidnapped me! Come on... Why?** And it can be seen an utterance in the picture of target language text **Kau menculikku! Kenapa?** This dialogue included to the phrase class loss because the translator does not put the phrase **come on** in source language to target language, or it can be said that the translator lost this phrase.

As written in chapter II, naturalness for a translation to be acceptable is to use a natural form of target text. Based on this information, the researcher concludes that the translator purposely lost the phrase **come on** to get a natural translation, so it can be more comfortable to be read by the readers.
In the dialogue in the picture of excerpt 7, Tintin says an utterance describes his happiness and it can be said that he is thanking to God for his salvation. It also can be seen that the utterance in source language text and target language text has some different words of translation. In the target language it is written I’m glad to be back on my feet again. However, in the target language text, it is written Aku senang sudah sehat lagi. It means the translator did some transformation in translating process of the dialogue. The translator lost the phrase of back on my feet in the source language was transformed into a word sehat in the target language to get a natural form. Besides, the italicized word in the source language is an idiom, so the translator has to translate it naturally and acceptably.

3. The Discussion of Clause Loss

The researcher found 15 bubbles of clause loss in the comic The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America and its Indonesian version Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika. To know more about the details, the researcher explain the analysis below:

The researcher categorized the dialogue in the picture above into protesting expression. It is said so because there is an utterance which explained
that the guy (Tintin) denying that he is not a gangster’s stood. It also can be read that in the source language text there is an utterance *Get your hands up, you crook! And I’ll take care of that paper. Just remember, I came to Chicago to clean the place up, not to become a gangster’s stooge!* Meanwhile, in the target language, it is written *Anak tangan penjahat! Dan ingat saja, aku datang ke Chicago untuk membersihkan tempat ini, bukan menjadi anak buah gangster!* It is clearly seen that the translator purposely wipe the underlined clause out.

As the researcher explained in the chapter II about comic and its translation, comic books represent not only the typical constraints of language (idiolect, double meanings, idioms, et al.) but also space limitations. For information, comics provide information not only through words but they are also linked to an image and the translator should confine translation to the space they have. Keep in mind that in most cases the original author does not do their work thinking about how it will be translated but about ensuring that the bubbles have the exact right size to fit the text. Thus, the researcher concluded that the translator abolished the underlined clause to fit the bubble of the comic.

**Excerpt 6, Page 62**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Source Language</th>
<th>Target Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Sensational developments in the Tintin story!... The famous and friendly reporter re-appears! Tintin, missing some days back from a banquet in his honour, led police to the hideout of the Central Syndicate of Chicago Gangsters. Apprehended were 335 suspects, and police collected hundreds of documents, expected to lead to many more arrests... This is a major clean-up for the city of Chicago... Mr Tintin admitted that the gangsters had been ruthless enemies, cruel and desperate men. More than once he nearly lost his life in the heat of his fight against crime... Today in his day of glory, We know that every American will wish to show his gratitude, and honour Tintin the reporter and his faithful companion, Snowy, heroes who put out of action the bosses of Chicago’s underworld!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Perkembangan sensasional! Tintin, yang hilang beberapa hari, kembali dari resmi, menerima penghormatan, dan menjadi simbol kejahatan. Ditemukan 335 tersangka, dan polisi mengumpulkan berbagai dokumen yang diharapkan akan mengarah ke banyak penangkapan... Ini adalah sebuah Membersihkan kota Chicago... Mr Tintin mengakui bahwa mob yang telah menjadi musuhnya yang brutal, dengan cara yang sia-sia. Lebih dari sekali, dia hampir kehilangan hidupnya dalam pertempuran melawan kejahatan... Hari ini adalah hari kemenangan kita, kita akan menunjukkan rasa terima kasih, dan menghormati Tintin, reporter dan sahabat setia, Snowy, para pensil maut yang menghancurkan kehidupan kota Chicago!</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

There is a quite long utterance by a man who looks like a radio announcer and he is announce people about Tintin’s bravery and heroic action. It can be seen in the last sentence of the utterance above that written *We know that every American will wish to show his gratitude, and honour Tintin, the reporter and his faithful companion, Snowy, heroes who put out of action the
**bosses of Chicago’s underworld.** And how it had been translated into target language *Kita tahu setiap orang Amerika ingin menunjukkan rasa terimakasihnya dan menghormati Tintin dan teman setianya, Milo!*

The researcher found a clause class loss in the picture above, because the translator did not translate the last underlined clause of the utterance and it had been deleted from the utterance in the target language. In the chapter II, it is already explained that comic books represent not only the typical constraints of language (idiolect, double meanings, idioms, et al.) but also space limitations. It can be seen that the translator had a space limitation, thus, the translator removed the last clause to fit the bubble of the comic without changing the meaning and the style of the source language text.

4. **The Discussion of Word Gain**

The researcher found 15 bubbles of word gain in the comic *The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America* and its translated version in Indonesian Language, *Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di America*. For further discussion, the researcher explain about the details in the analysis below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Excerpt 7, Page 5</th>
<th>Source Language</th>
<th>Target Language</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><em>So! The famous reporter!... A little kid with big ideas, like he’s gonna make war on Al Capone... On me, the king of Chicago!</em></td>
<td><em>Jadi inilah si wartawan terkenal!... Anak kecil dig ide besar, sok-sokan akan menyerangku Al Capone... Raja Chicago!</em></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first excerpt of word class gain in expressive dialogue of the comic found in the page 5. The researcher focuses on the first sentence in the source language *So! The famous reporter!* which has been translated into target language become *Jadi inilah si wartawan terkenal!* The italicized word is the word added by the translator although this word can not be found in the source language. The researcher concludes that the translator added a word “inilah” in the target language to give an emphasizing in the utterance.
Excerpt 8, Page 12
Source Language

My dear Mr. Tintin, this is a pleasure! I’m glad to meet you! Do please sit down... Have a cigar?... No?... Then I’ll come straight to the point...

Target Language

Tuan Tintin yang baik, sungguh kehormatan besar! Aku semang bila berjumpa denganmu. Silakan duduk... Mau rokok? Tidak?... Kalau begitu aku langsung saja...

In the source language text of the picture above, it is written My dear Mr. Tintin, this is a pleasure! I’m glad to meet you! Meanwhile in the target language text it is written Tuan Tintin yang baik, sungguh kehormatan besar! Thus, the translator was gained a word besar in the target language which does not exist in the source language. In this case, the translator wanted to emphasize the feeling of the man who says that he feels so honored, so the translator added a word besar in the target language text.

5. The Discussion of Phrase Gain

The researcher found 4 bubbles of phrase gain in the comic The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America which has been translated into Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika. For further explanation, the researcher gives the details in the following analysis result below:

Excerpt 9, Page 2
Source Language

Hey, what’s the game?... We’re locked in!... And these shutters are made of steel! We’re stymied then. Even I can’t chew through those!

Target Language

Hei, apa-apaan ini?... Kita dikerung!... Dan penutup ini terbuat dari baja! Tamatlah kita. Kalau baja, aku tak bisa menggigitnya.
There are two utterances in the picture of excerpt 9 said by Tintin and Snowy. In the source language, there is an utterance by Snowy that says *We’re stymied then. Even I can’t chew through those!* while in the target language is written *Tamatlah kita. Kalau baja, aku tak bisa mengigitnya!* The translator added a phrase of *kalau baja* in the target language to make the text as natural as possible. Besides that, it will be sounds awkward if the translator translate it word for word without adding that phrase. It is also because the translator wanted to make an aesthetic form of the text.

*Excerpt 10, Page 5*

**Source Language**

Take it easy, Bambino, I gotta you covered. The boss… he’s-a coming...

W-w-what… h-hh- happened?

**Target Language**

Tenang, Bambino, aku menjagamu. Sebentar lagi bos datang...

A-a-apa… y-yang t-terjadi?

The man with a gun in his hand says in the source language of the picture above *Take it easy, Bambino, I gotta you covered. The boss… he’s-a coming…* Meanwhile, in the target language it can be read *Tenang, Bambino, aku menjagamu. Sebentar lagi bos datang.* The translator added a phrase of *sebentar lagi* in the target language. What is often seen as ‘lost’ from the source language context may be replaced in the target language context. Thus, the translator added a phrase of *sebentar lagi* to replaced *he’s coming* behind a phrase *The boss* in the target language text. Moreover, in the picture can be seen that the boss is not there yet, but he is on his way to come over.

**CONCLUSION**

In this chapter the researcher would like to give the conclusion about this thesis. The researcher had done all the analysis of this thesis and especially on the fourth chapter. Based on the fourth chapter, the researcher concludes that in this thesis the process of loss and gain can be found. The process of loss and gain gives the effects to the readers to catch the messages of the SL to the TL easily.

In the research of Loss and Gain in Translation Process of a Comic “The Adventures of Tintin: Tintin in America” into Indonesian Version “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika”, the researcher found 110 patterns of loss and 19 patterns of gain in the translation process of the comic.
After reading both English version as the SL and Indonesian version as the TL, the researcher found 129 processes of loss and gain. It can be divided into two parts. The first part is the loss process. The researcher found 110 pattern, they are 33 or 30% patterns of the word class loss, 62 or 56% patterns of the phrase class loss, and 15 or 14% of the clause class loss.

The second part is gain process. The researcher only found 19 patterns of gain process in this study. They are 15 or 79% of the word class gain, and 4 or 21% of the phrase class gain. Meanwhile, the clause class gain is not found by the researcher in this translated comic.

The reasons why the translator did the loss and gain process in translating the comic ‘The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America’ into “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika” are mostly because the translator wanted to make a good translation that sounds natural and acceptable by the readers. Besides that, the translator sometimes did the loss process because of the space limitation, so he tried to eliminate some words without changing the meaning or the context of the source text.

Finally, the researcher concludes that the translation result of the comic ‘The Adventure of Tintin: Tintin in America’ into “Petualangan Tintin: Tintin di Amerika” is good and acceptable.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

http://cec.vcn.bc.ca/cmp/modules/rsh-krm.htm
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Comic
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Language
http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Tintin